Planning Streetcar Routes For Maximum Sustainable Economic and Social Benefit

Franklin B. Conaway and Associates, Ltd.
Streetcar Project Supervisor,
TOD Project Supervisor
Columbus Downtown Development Corporation
2005-2006
I. Criteria for Assessing the Viability of Streetcar Routes

Twenty Point Checklist for Rating the Efficiency of Streetcar Circulators
A. Physical Considerations

• Existing street grid and traffic patterns are conducive to streetcars and automobiles operating smoothly within shared right-of-way.

• Topography is friendly to streetcar operations within operational areas of the proposed streetcar system.

• There is an absence of physical barriers.
B. Planning Considerations

• Operates directly on central business district’s principal street corridor(s).
• Operates through center of the central business district’s highest employment concentrations.
• Connects directly to residential concentrations.
• Connects directly to entertainment district(s) with venue(s) of at least 5,000 person capacity per event.
• Connects directly to mixed-use areas outside of the CBD.
• Connects directly to registered historic districts and significant historic sites.
• Connects directly to major city hospital(s).
• Connects directly to main convention center.
• Connects directly to principal hotels.
• Connects directly to principal art museum(s) and/or arts districts.
• Connects directly to major urban parks.
• Connects directly to multiple performing arts theaters.
• Connects directly to important centers of government.
• Connects efficiently to other modes of transportation throughout length of the system.
• Connects directly to significant urban educational institutions.
• Connects directly to basic residentially oriented commercial activities.
• Connects efficiently to other modes of transportation throughout length of the system.
• Connects directly to planned mixed use development areas, including future residential concentrations.
Proposed Initial Streetcar Routes and Nearby Attractions, Destinations, and Employment Centers
Building Livable Communities with Transit
Building Livable Communities with Transit
Building Livable Communities with Transit
Building Livable Communities with Transit
Building Livable Communities with Transit
Rating Your Streetcar Circulator
A Perfect Score is 20

Columbus, Ohio – 18
Portland, Oregon – 14
II. Key Elements of an Effective Streetcar Based TOD Strategy
• High quality existing data
• High quality field surveys
• Take maximum advantage of existing assets
• Establish clear, straightforward TOD Objective
• Pay attention to federally supported Public Policies
• Create an implementation strategy that will really work through “Guiding Components”
  - Priority Development Zones
  - Adaptive use of existing buildings
  - Form-Based development concepts
  - Establish measurement producing development goals that will actually be attained
Building Livable Communities with Transit
Building Livable Communities with Transit
Form-Based Development

[Map of Discovery District - Columbus with Form-Based Development highlighted]
• Select Demonstration Projects
• Form strongest possible Private/Public Partnerships
• Implement with Determination
III. Economic Development

Projections
• Economic development projections have merit only to the extent that they are based upon reliable existing data and a TOD Strategy that will actually be implemented.

**Caveat** Economic development projections will never be reached unless the TOD Strategy is implemented in parallel with construction and operation of the streetcar circulator!
# OVERALL RETURN ON INVESTMENT RESULTING FROM STREETCAR CIRCULATOR – COLUMBUS OH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ROUTE</th>
<th>CAPITAL INVESTMENT</th>
<th>ANNUAL OPERATING COST</th>
<th>RESULTING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT BY END OF 2013</th>
<th>Return</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>2008</strong></td>
<td><strong>2008</strong></td>
<td><strong>2008</strong></td>
<td><strong>2013</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue (High Street--Frankfurt to Buttles)</td>
<td>$64 - 77 million</td>
<td>$4.3 - 4.6 million</td>
<td>$216 - 248 million</td>
<td>387%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue + Green East Loop (High to Washington)</td>
<td>$84 - 100 million</td>
<td>$5.0 - 5.4 million</td>
<td>$410 - 464 million</td>
<td>557%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue + Green West Loop (Neil to High)</td>
<td>$76 - 92 million</td>
<td>$5.0 - 5.4 million</td>
<td>$319 - 356 million</td>
<td>464%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue + Both Green Loops (Neil to Washington)</td>
<td>$96 - 115 million</td>
<td>$5.2 - 5.6 million</td>
<td>$508 - 578 million</td>
<td>603%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue + Red Extension (Frankfurt to 11th Ave.)</td>
<td>$97 - 116 million</td>
<td>$5.0 - 5.4 million</td>
<td>$270 - 308 million</td>
<td>319%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue + Green Loops + Red (All of the Above)</td>
<td>$128 - 154 million</td>
<td>$5.8 - 6.4 million</td>
<td>$562 - 637 million</td>
<td>496%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>