WHEN SUCCESS IS THE THREAT: REINING IN REVITALIZATION AROUND TRANSIT

Moderator: Susan Petheram, AICP
Senior Planner
FFKR, Salt Lake City, UT

Matthew D’Amico AICP, ASLA
Senior Principal
Design Collective, Inc., Baltimore, MD

Gregory Floyd
Senior Land Use Planner
Metropolitan Atlanta Rapid Transit Authority (MARTA), Atlanta, GA

Matthew Bourke
Senior Planner
City of Vancouver, Vancouver, BC
SESSION OUTLINE:

- FRAMEWORK FOR SUCCESS
- SUCCESS IN EAST LIBERTY
- SUCCESS IN ATLANTA
- SUCCESS IN VANCOUVER
- Q&A
FRAMEWORK FOR SUCCESS: URBAN FORM & THE CULTURE OF PLACE

Susan Petheram, AICP
Senior Planner, FFKR
Salt Lake City, UT
THE CULTURE OF PLACE: URBAN FORM

- Infrastructure
- Buildings
- People

Diagram showing interconnections between infrastructure, buildings, and people.
CASE STUDY — SALT LAKE CITY, UTAH
SALT LAKE CITY’S GRID

- Large 10-acre blocks
- Wide streets
SALT LAKE CITY: URBAN AGRARIAN SETTLEMENT
TYPICAL STREETCAR SUBURBS: RADIAL URBAN FORM PATTERNS
SALT LAKE CITY’S STREETCAR SUBURBS: EXTENSION OF THE GRID
REGIONAL CONTEXT TODAY
GRID — WITH BARRIERS TO WALKABILITY
THE S-LINE CORRIDOR
HISTORIC GRID – EARLY SUBDIVISIONS
900 SOUTH STATION
THANK YOU!

Susan Petheram
Associate | Senior Planner, FFKR
PhD Candidate, City & Metropolitan Planning
spetheram@ffkr.com
SUCCESS IN EAST LIBERTY
WHEN SUCCESS IS THE THREAT:
REIGNING IN REVITALIZATION AROUND TRANSIT

REVITALIZING EAST LIBERTY
PITTSBURGH, PA

SEPTEMBER 9, 2019
LEARNING OBJECTIVES

» Neighborhood and TOD (BRT)
» Disinvestment due to 1960’s Urban Renewal Policy
» Revitalization Plan results in $500M New Investment

Success has led to Unintended Consequences
Lessons Learned
HISTORY

EARLY 1900’S

» A Thriving Neighborhood
» Attracted by Jobs
» Dense, Walkable and Diverse
» Vibrant Mainstreet (Penn Avenue)
» Ethnic Diversity
1960’S URBAN RENEWAL

Why?
» To Compete with Suburbia
» Urban Redevelopment Authority (URA) Plan
» Opposition but Approved
» Demolished 1,200 Homes
» Displaced 3,800 People
» Removed 1.3M SF of CBD
1960’S URBAN RENEWAL

What did they get?

» 1,800 New Apartments – Public and Affordable Housing

» 3 High-rise Apartments – Public Housing

» “Closing” of Penn Avenue (perceived barrier)

» Penn Circle: 1-way Loop to Avoid Penn Avenue

» Pedestrian-only Retail Mall
A NEIGHBORHOOD IN DECLINE

» Loss of Walkability
» Loss of 500 Businesses; Declining Mainstreet
» Low Income Families + Poverty
» Disinvestment – Resources/Capital + Redlining
» Loss of Services, Amenities, Jobs
» Decreased Homeownership
SMALL SUCCESS STORIES

1980-2000

« 1979 – Creation of East Liberty Development Inc (ELDI)
« 200 Properties Purchased for Rehab/Sale/Mothball
« 1983 – Busway (BRT)
« Removed Pedestrian Mall
« 2000 – Home Depot, 300 Jobs

CREDIT: EAST LIBERTY DEVELOPMENT, INC.
1980-2000

» High rises Remained a Stigma
» No New Mixed-Income or Market-Rate Housing
» Remained Largely Low Income
» Penn Circle 1-way Remained a Barrier
» Penn Avenue Lacked needed Services/Businesses
» Limited Meaningful Investment
2000-2003

» Public Engagement – Residents, Businesses, Stakeholders
» Demolish High-rises
» Increase Market-rate Housing & Ownership
» Improve Walkability
» Restore Street Grid, Block Patterns, Infill
» Revive Penn Ave: Streetscape & Infrastructure
CHALLENGES

2000-2003

» Limited market
» Lack of investment interest
» Who and how will this be done?
THE FIRST STEPS

» Demolish High-rises
» Engaged Developers – HUD, Housing Authority, URA
» 2003 – 2007: Mixed-income Housing
» 2005 – 2007: Demo 2 High-rises
» 2005 – Penn Manor: 55 Units, Senior Affordable
THE FIRST STEPS

» 2006 – Eastside I and II: Whole Foods, 400 jobs
» Meaningful Change Attracted Investment Interest
» 2010 – Bakery Square – Google, 400k Commercial, 110 Hotel
» 2011 – Target
» 2012 - $15M TIGER Grant (for busway station)
MAJOR SUCCESS

» 2012 – 2015: Eastside Bond
» East Liberty Transit Center
» 350 Apartments

» 50,000 SF Retail
» 570 Shared Parking Spaces
UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES

» Gentrification
» Increased Land Values (homes)
» $10K – to $100K – to $600 to $700K
» Increased Property Taxes
» Forced Lower Income Residents out
» Owners Sold for Profit
» Backlash - Public $$$ Used for Non-Aff. Developments
» No Longer Affordable Neighborhood
LESSONS LEARNED

» Did Not Plan for (or even consider) Gentrification
» How do You Anticipate What you Don’t Know?
LESSONS LEARNED

» Replacement Public Housing was Successful – 1 for 1 Replacement
» Perception? Swing was too far to Market-rate
» 1000 New Market-rate Units with No Required % Affordable

» Could have had Homestead or Property Tax Freeze/Abatement
» Rental Units in Existing Homes?
» Friendship CDC: Rehab and Affordable Rents for Artists, Small Businesses, Housing
CURRENT EFFORTS

» 100 Unit for Sale, Single Family Affordable
» Working on New Affordable Housing Policy
» Considering Property Tax Mitigation Program
» How to Address Rising Home Values
» Pilot Land Trust Development in Hazelwood
» Lottery: Subsidize Property Rising Home Values – Seniors
» Middle-income Families
RAIL-VOLUTION 2019

SEPTEMBER 9, 2019
SUCCESS IN ATLANTA
Transit Oriented Development
Strategic Planning At MARTA

Gregory T. Floyd, AICP
Senior Development Project Manager-MARTA
Strategic Planning Process

- TOD Strategic Station Planning at MARTA undergoes a comprehensive process that includes land use, transportation and of course the public.

- TOD Strategic Station Planning is a partnership between MARTA and its member jurisdictions- City of Atlanta, Clayton, Fulton and DeKalb Counties.

- The most recent example is the I-20 East TOD Strategic Plan.
I-20 East TOD Study Objectives

- **Corridor-wide** land use TOD strategy
- **Economic development** and **equitable TOD** programs and policies
- Strategies to transform communities to be **livable, walkable and transit-friendly**
- **Catalyze private development** around stations
- **Support** competitiveness for FTA New Starts funding.
I-20 East Corridor Location Setting

REGIONAL LOCATION
- High Capacity Transit Corridor
- Proposed Transit Station
- Proposed Station Area (1/2 Mile Buffer)
- 1-Mile Buffer Study Area

MARTA Rail Lines
- BLUE
- GOLD
- GREEN
- RED

Points of Interest
- USA Airports
- Employment Hubs
- State of Georgia

MARTA Service Area
# I-20 East Corridor Demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>I-20 East Corridor</th>
<th>Indian Creek</th>
<th>Covington Highway</th>
<th>Wesley Chapel Road</th>
<th>Panola Road</th>
<th>Lithonia Industrial Boulevard</th>
<th>Stonecrest Mall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Population</strong></td>
<td>67,963</td>
<td>12,163</td>
<td>5,661</td>
<td>9,700</td>
<td>9,545</td>
<td>6,114</td>
<td>8,934</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Households</strong></td>
<td>25,245</td>
<td>3,419</td>
<td>2,291</td>
<td>3,591</td>
<td>3,793</td>
<td>2,506</td>
<td>4,041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Median Household Income</strong></td>
<td>$38,269</td>
<td>$51,378</td>
<td>$40,802</td>
<td>$43,791</td>
<td>$51,301</td>
<td>$30,763</td>
<td>$37,554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Percent Owners</strong></td>
<td>41.2%</td>
<td>60.9%</td>
<td>42.1%</td>
<td>54.1%</td>
<td>34.9%</td>
<td>25.6%</td>
<td>25.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Percent Renters</strong></td>
<td>58.8%</td>
<td>39.1%</td>
<td>57.9%</td>
<td>45.9%</td>
<td>65.1%</td>
<td>74.4%</td>
<td>74.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: ESRI & BAE Economics, 2017
## I-20 East Corridor Demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I-20 EAST CORRIDOR RESIDENTIAL AND COMMERCIAL RENTAL RATES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I-20 East Corridor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Monthly Rents*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ave. Asking Office Rents Per SF**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ave. Asking Retail Rents Per SF**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: CoStar Group & BAE Economics, 2017

Note(s):  
*Represents Second Quarter 2017 figures  
**Represents First Quarter 2017 figures
Public Engagement Events

TOD Public Design Workshop Lou Walker Center
April 26, 2018
Station Area Visions Based Upon Public Engagement
Equitable TOD Analysis

- Equitable TOD strives to ensure that all residents have access to the benefits of TOD.
- The Plan examined housing, transit, and critical facilities.
- One significant finding is that there are no mixed-income housing facilities currently present in the Corridor.

Wesley Chapel Station Area Now
Wesley Chapel Station Area Concept
Potential Recommendations

- Inclusion of the I-20 East TOD Plan into the Atlanta Regional Commission’s Livable Centers Initiatives (LCI) program.
- Adjustments to the zoning codes along the Corridor to promote higher densities and TOD form based design.
- Equity evaluator tools in the development process.
Thank You

Gregory T. Floyd, AICP
Senior Development Project Manager, MARTA
gfloyd@itsmarta.com
404-848-5508
SUCCESS IN VANCOUVER
When Success is the Threat: Reining in Revitalization Around Transit
Planning for Job Space in Downtown Vancouver
Matthew Bourke – Senior Planner, City of Vancouver
Ensuring Space for Housing AND Jobs

• Balancing opportunities for housing and jobs requires a long term view

• In the mid 2000s, the City made an intentional choice to reserve space for job growth

• Space for ~20,000 jobs currently under construction or in approvals
A Central City in a Growing Region

Metro Vancouver:
- 2.5M People (+ 16% since 2006)
- 1.3M Jobs (+ 17% since 2006)

City of Vancouver:
- 631,500 People (+ 9% since 2006)
- 427,000 Jobs (+ 13% since 2006)
Strong Growth in the Metropolitan Core

- **190,000 People** (+23% since 2006)
- **280,000 Jobs** (+14% since 2006)
New Residential Buildings Have Transformed the Downtown Over the Past 30 Years
Policies to Encourage Downtown Living have been **Very** Successful
Both Population and Jobs Have been Growing in the Metropolitan Core

Metro Core Population vs. Employment

* Job data includes estimate of jobs with “no fixed workplace”
Meet the Huntleys, living happily in north False Creek. From left, mom Tanya; Simon, 13; Johnny, 6; Charlie, 2; Emma, 10; and dad Robert. They love the lifestyle and they’re far from alone: Many say the mix of people — singles, seniors and families — as well as the amenities and the slow pace of life make downtown their choice. Find out why: Story, B1
Condo-mania!

Real-estate sales are booming, with buyers lured by zero down payments and low interest rates. In Vancouver yesterday, 494 condo units sold for $123 million in just nine hours. B.C.’s top realtor claimed a personal sales record

Babak Shahbazi (right) was among scores of potential buyers who waited all night to be first in line when units of the proposed Yaletown condo complex went on sale yesterday. By 7 o’clock, 494 of 612 available units had sold for $123 million.

Interview with Prime Minister Paul Martin, A
By the Early 2000s, City Started Seeing Proposals for Residential Projects in Areas Reserved for Job Space (CBD)
City Initiated the Metropolitan Core Jobs and Economy Land Use Plan Process in 2006

To ensure there is enough development and transportation capacity to accommodate future job growth and economic activity in the Metro Core.
2006 Study Found that Zoning was **Insufficient** to Accommodate Anticipated Job Growth
2006 Study also Reaffirmed the Importance of the CBD

- Only ~15% of the downtown land area
- Constrained on four sides, can only grow through intensification
- Focal point of the region’s transportation system
- Valued enormously by the business community
2006 Study also Examined the Role of Mixed Use (Residential and Commercial) Buildings

- Mixed Use buildings have a role in providing job space
- City policy encourages them across many areas of the downtown
- Residential development (stand-alone or as mixed-use) increases land values
- Need to ensure that commercial buildings are viable in the CBD
2006 Study also Examined the Role of Mixed Use (Residential and Commercial) Buildings

- Mixed use buildings in the CBD result in lost capacity, and are problematic for meeting job space capacity demands
Examples of Policy Changes Resulting from 2006 Study

+2.0 FSR & Continue to Restrict Residential

[Map showing areas A and B with restricted residential zones]
Examples of Policy Changes Resulting from 2006 Study

+2.0 FSR & Continue to Restrict Residential
Examples of Policy Changes Resulting from 2006 Study

Continue Min. 2 FSR Non-residential
Significant Job Space Under Development in the City Today

• Strong demand for major office in the DT
  – < 4% vacancy rate downtown
  – 3,523,000 sq. ft. of Office Space Under Construction or in Approvals as of July 2019 (space for ~20,000 Jobs).
  – 68% of Office Space Under Construction in the Region is in the City of Vancouver
  – Continued growth in professional, scientific and technical services (e.g. technology, financial & legal services)

• Continued growth in population and tourism
  – Food and accommodation
  – Retail and services
Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today

1133 Melville St - The Stack
CBD Shoulder

Development Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning</th>
<th>CD-1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FSR</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office</td>
<td>605,000 sq.ft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status</td>
<td>Under Construction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today
Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today

510 West Georgia - Telus Garden
CBD Shoulder

**Development Statistics**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning</th>
<th>CD-1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FSR</td>
<td>19.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office</td>
<td>452,000 sq.ft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status</td>
<td>Completed (2015)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today
Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today

349 West Georgia – The Post
CBD Shoulder

Development Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning</th>
<th>CD-1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FSR</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office</td>
<td>+1,000,000 sq.ft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status</td>
<td>Under Construction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today
Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today

**731 Homer St (formerly 400 West Georgia)**

**CBD Shoulder**

**Development Statistics**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning</th>
<th>CD-1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FSR</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office</td>
<td>352,000 sq.ft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status</td>
<td>Under Construction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today
Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today

1090 W Pender
CBD

Development Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning</th>
<th>CD-1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FSR</td>
<td>17.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office</td>
<td>550,000 sq.ft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today
Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today

**753 Seymour St – Vancouver Centre II**

CBD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Zoning</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FSR</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Office</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Status</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today
Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today

320 Granville
CBD

Development Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning</th>
<th>CD-1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FSR</td>
<td>24.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office</td>
<td>306,000 sq.ft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status</td>
<td>Under Construction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Examples of Major Office Buildings Under Development in the Core Today
Population and Jobs are Projected to Continue Growing in the Metro Core

- 280,000 jobs in the Metro Core, for every 2 residents there are 3 jobs
- Both jobs and residents continue to grow over the next 25 years

* Based on 2013 Regional Context Statement
Looking Ahead:
Employment Lands and Economy Review
www.vancouver.ca/employmentlands
Thank You

matthew.bourke@vancouver.ca